

1 Issa K. Moe, Bar No. 254998
Issa.Moe@lawmoss.com
2 MOSS & BARNETT, P.A.
150 South Fifth Street
3 Suite 1200
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402
4 Telephone: (6212) 877-5277
Fax: (612) 877-5076

5
6 Attorneys for Defendant
Concora Credit Inc.

7
8
9 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
10 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

11 SHARON BALLARD,
12
13 Plaintiff,

14 v.

15 CONCORA CREDIT INC.;
AND, EXPERIAN
16 INFORMATION SOLUTIONS,
INC.,

17 Defendants.
18

Case No.: 2:23-cv-09554-CBM-E

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

Judge: Consuelo B. Marshall
Magistrate Judge: Charles F. Eick

19 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

20 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
21 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
22 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may
23 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
24 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
25 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
26 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
27 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
28 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth

1 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
2 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
3 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a
4 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

5 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

6 This action is likely to involve confidential, proprietary, or trade secret
7 information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for
8 any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential
9 and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things,
10 confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential
11 business practices, or other confidential or commercial information (including
12 information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise
13 generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise
14 protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions,
15 or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the
16 prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to
17 adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to
18 ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in
19 preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the
20 litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is
21 justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be
22 designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated
23 without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public
24 manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of
25 this case.
26
27
28

1 2. DEFINITIONS

2 2.1 Action: *Sharon Ballard v. Concora Credit Inc. et al*, Court File
3 No. 2:23-cv-09554-CBM-E, United States District Court for the Central
4 District of California.

5 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the
6 designation of information or items under this Order.

7 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
8 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection
9 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good
10 Cause Statement.

11 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
12 their support staff).

13 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
14 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
15 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

16 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
17 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
18 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
19 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

20 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
21 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
22 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

23 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
24 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
25 counsel.

26 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association,
27 or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.
28

1 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a
2 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
3 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
4 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

5 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
6 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
7 support staffs).

8 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
9 Discovery Material in this Action.

10 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
11 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
12 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
13 and their employees and subcontractors.

14 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
15 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

16 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
17 Material from a Producing Party.

18 3. SCOPE

19 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
20 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
21 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
22 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
23 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

24 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
25 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

26 4. DURATION

27 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
28 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees

1 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
2 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action,
3 with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
4 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
5 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
6 pursuant to applicable law.

7 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

8 **5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.**
9 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
10 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
11 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
12 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
13 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
14 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
15 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

16 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
17 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
18 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to
19 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the
20 Designating Party to sanctions.

21 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
22 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
23 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

24 **5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations.** Except as otherwise provided in
25 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
26 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
27 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
28 produced.

1 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

2 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
3 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
4 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
5 “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that
6 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
7 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
8 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

9 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
10 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
11 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
12 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
13 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the
14 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine
15 which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,
16 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
17 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
18 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
19 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
20 appropriate markings in the margins).

21 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify
22 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
23 deposition all protected testimony.

24 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and
25 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on
26 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
27 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information
28

1 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
2 protected portion(s).

3 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
4 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
5 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such
6 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make
7 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
8 provisions of this Order.

9 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

10 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
11 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
12 Scheduling Order.

13 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
14 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

15 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
16 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
17 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
18 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
19 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
20 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
21 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
22 challenge.

23 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

24 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
25 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
26 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
27 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
28 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a

1 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
2 DISPOSITION).

3 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
4 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
5 authorized under this Order.

6 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
7 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
8 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
9 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

10 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
11 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
12 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

13 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
14 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

15 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
16 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
17 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

18 (d) the court and its personnel;

19 (e) court reporters and their staff;

20 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
21 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
22 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

23 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
24 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

25 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
26 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the witness and
27 the witness’s counsel sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will
28 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the

1 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), or unless otherwise
 2 agreed by the Designating Party, or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
 3 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may
 4 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone
 5 except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

6 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
 7 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED
 9 IN OTHER LITIGATION

10 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
 11 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
 12 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

13 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
 14 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

15 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
 16 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
 17 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include
 18 a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

19 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
 20 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

21 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
 22 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
 23 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
 24 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
 25 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
 26 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
 27 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
 28 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

1 9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
2 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

3 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
4 Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
5 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
6 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
7 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

8 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
9 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
10 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
11 confidential information, then the Party shall:

12 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-
13 Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
14 agreement with a Non-Party;

15 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
16 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
17 specific description of the information requested; and

18 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
19 Non-Party, if requested.

20 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within
21 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
22 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
23 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
24 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
25 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
26 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and
27 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.
28

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on

1 any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective
2 Order.

3 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
4 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material
5 may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
6 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
7 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
8 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

9 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

10 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
11 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must
12 return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As
13 used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts,
14 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the
15 Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the
16 Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if
17 not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that
18 (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was
19 returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any
20 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or
21 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel
22 are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
23 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition
24 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
25 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival
26 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective
27 Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).
28

14. VIOLATION

Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED: March 29, 2024

By /s/ Matthew M. Loker

LOKER LAW, APC

Matthew M. Loker, Esq. (279939)

Elizabeth A. Wagner, Esq. (317098)

1303 East Grand Avenue, Suite 101

Arroyo Grande, CA 93420

Telephone: (805) 994-0177

E-Mail: matt@loker.law

E-Mail: elizabeth@lokerlaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

DATED: March 29, 2024

By /s/ Issa K. Moe

MOSS & BARNETT,

A Professional Association

Issa K. Moe, Esq. (254998)

150 South Fifth Street, Suite 1200

Minneapolis, MN 55402

Telephone: (612) 877-5277

E-Mail: Issa.Moe@lawmoss.com

Attorneys for Defendant

ATTESTATION OF E-FILED SIGNATURE

I, Issa K. Moe, attest that all signatories listed above have read and approved this stipulation and consent to the filing of same in this action.

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED

DATED: 3/29/24

/S/ CHARLES F. EICK

Charles F. Eick

United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____
 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty
 of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective
 Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of
 California on [date] in the case of *Sharon Ballard v. Concora Credit Inc. et al*,
Court File No. 2:23-cv-09554-CBM-E, United States District Court for the District
 of Central California. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of
 this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to
 so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt.
 I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item
 that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in
 strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District
 Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the
 terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings
 occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____
 [print or type full name] of _____ [print or type full
 address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in
 connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this
 Stipulated Protective Order.

Date:

City and State where sworn and signed:

Printed name:

Signature: _____

- 14 -

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

Case No.: 2:23-CV-09554-CBM-E